

**ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 1:  
Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind  
the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and  
Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission**

**Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP**

Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task force  
Transport Action Canada  
Principal, Wellar Consulting Inc.



***Report prepared for  
Transport Action Ontario  
and  
Transport Action Canada***

December, 2012

## 1. Executive Summary

This Interim Report outlines the terms of reference for ONR-ONTC Research Task Force activity, and then discusses the requests for details about and access to the studies and other productions containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

## 2. Task Force Terms of Reference

At the request of Transport Action Ontario, the mission of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force is to examine the studies done by the Government of Ontario through the Department of Northern Development and Mines, as well as any other agencies or agents of the Government of Ontario, and to present:

1. An inventory of the provided studies and other productions containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.
2. An opinion as to the soundness of the research undertaken; and
3. An opinion as to the extent to which the decisions by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission are based upon, supported by, justified by, or are otherwise derived from methodologically sound research.

## 3. Structuring the Requests for Details and Access

The initial round of requests for details about and access to the studies and other productions containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission were sent to Rick Bartolucci, Minister of Northern Development and Mines, as well as to candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario.

Responsibility for the Ontario Northland Railway (ONR) and the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC) falls within the purview of the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM). As Minister of MNDM, R. Bartolucci headed an agency with (seeming) responsibility for commissioned studies and other productions provided to members of Cabinet in association with the termination and divestment decisions. Under the circumstances, therefore, it is appropriate that the requests begin with R. Bartolucci, and the circle of contacts be expanded in a subsequent round(s) should it be acknowledged or ascertained that another agency or other agencies also contributed studies, advisories, recommendations, etc., to the deliberations.

Among the seven candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario -- Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray, Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Takhar, and Kathleen Wynne – five of them -- Hoskins, Murray, Sousa, Takhar, and Wynne – were members of Cabinet when the termination and divestment decisions were made. Since Hoskins, Murray, Sousa, Takhar, and Wynne have first-hand experience with the studies and other productions provided to members of Cabinet, and may also be held to account for the termination and divestment decisions during and after the leadership campaign, it is appropriate to include them in the list of persons to be contacted in the first round.

In the cases of two leadership candidates, G. Kennedy and S. Pupatello, they were not in Cabinet at the time when the subject decisions were made. However, as former members of Cabinet and presently candidates for the position of Leader of the Liberal Party of Ontario, their views on the ONR-ONTC decision process and outcomes, the study reports and other productions which were or were not commissioned and were or were not used in the decision process, and the disposition of Task Force requests for details about reports and access to digital versions of reports, are pertinent to the Research Task Force's mission.

Finally, this is not a Commission of Inquiry, nor is it a project funded by what might be termed a “vested interest with deep pockets”. Transport Action Ontario is a public interest group, the Task Force is totally apolitical, and all communications generated by the Task Force are an open file.

It is therefore expected that requests for details about and access to reports and other productions will be treated with the highest degree of respect and associated due diligence which all political parties profess to hold towards citizens.

Specifically, because the requested materials would have been produced by public officials and public institutions using public funds, it is expected that requests from citizens and public interest groups for details about and access to reports and other productions will be honoured in a direct, timely and comprehensive manner. A few sentences should be sufficient to make these expectations crystal clear.

By direct, I mean to the point: no bobbing-and-weaving, no stonewalling, no going off on tangents, just clean, clear, pertinent answers to the questions asked.

In regard, to timeliness, the materials being requested from government agencies should entail a minimum of technical difficulty to retrieve, and to forward as requested. That is, if the materials exist they are already on file, and in all likelihood have been accessed previously on perhaps numerous occasions. It therefore seems that timely should mean no more than a week turnaround at most for the vast majority of inquiries, and perhaps two weeks maximum for a domain which involves cross-matching of multiple keywords and files, or synthesizing multiple files.

As to the matter of comprehensives, it is expected that the complete body of studies and productions will be made known upon receipt of an initial request, and that it will not be necessary to “pry” research materials away from their custodians, files, etc.

Towards that end, inquiries are based on terminology which has been around for many decades, yet is sufficiently directive in the vast majority of cases to point to the studies and productions which are pertinent to the Task Force mission.

#### **4. Study Domains**

The study domains selected for this project are grouped into two classes, those involving regional impacts associated with the termination and divestment decisions, and those involving Ontario Northland Railway passenger and freight infrastructure, operations, and service, and the ONTC as an entity.

The domains selected for the first round are similar to those which have been in the development literature from at least the 1960s, so the domains are not only ‘tried-and-true’, but they do not require MNDM or other government agency to be at the leading edge of research in order to provide the requested materials.

Moreover, and based on the development literature for Canada and internationally, each domain is a pertinent subject for analysis by those advising members of Cabinet on the termination and divestment issues.

And, further in that vein, they are pertinent subjects for consideration by members of Cabinet when deciding whether, when, how, under what conditions, etc., to terminate *The Northlander* or divest the ONTC. It is recalled that members of Cabinet are first and foremost MPPs (Members of Provincial Parliament), and all of them have experience with making promises, giving commitments, etc., in a variety of domains, including those that did, could have, or should have received consideration during the deliberations about terminating *The Northlander* or divesting the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

The domains selected for regional impact assessments are as follows:

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure construction and maintenance
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

For the ONR/ONTC component of the research program the focus in the initial round is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the timelines are a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The domain of interest involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could have been done or be done, and what should have been done or be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038).

## **5. Record of Initial Round of Requests and Associated Communications**

As noted above, requests for details about the studies done and access to study reports undertaken to inform, support, justify, warrant, etc., the decisions by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission were sent to Rick Bartolucci, Minister of Northern Development and Mines, as well as to the seven candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario – Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray, Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Takhar, and Kathleen Wynne.

Copies of emails sent to R. Bartolucci and to the candidates requesting details about the studies done and access to study reports undertaken to inform, support, justify, warrant, etc., the decisions by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission are included in Appendix A.

## **6. Conclusion**

Interim Report 1 provides the terms of reference for the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and outlines the process adopted to request the study reports and other productions which are needed to assess the soundness of the research behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

### **Appendix A**

#### **Emails Requesting Details About and Access to Studies behind the Decision by Cabinet to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission**

The emails are presented in chronological order. In the interests of space and formatting, Candidates-C refers to E. Hoskins, G. Murray, C. Sousa, H. Takhar, and K. Wynne who were members of Cabinet at the time of the termination and divestment decisions. Candidates-NC refers to G. Kennedy and S. Pupatello who were not involved in the decisions as MPPs. In the interests of space and limiting redundancy,

when the same letter went to Candidates-C and Candidates-NC, respectively, one letter is used for a group.

As seen upon inspection, many of the emails had secondary recipients. This is necessary in part to ensure that all the principals are informed as to all the communications which have been sent out to request details about and access to studies behind the decision by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, request explanations about materials received or not received during deliberations, etc.

Email dates, primary recipients, and subjects are as follows.

No.	Date	To	Subject Heading
1	10-29-12	R.Bartolucci	Update re the ONR-ONTC Project, and the VIA Town Meeting in S.S. Marie on November 8
2	11-23-12	R.Bartolucci	ONTC
3	11-27-12	R.Bartolucci	Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions
4	07-12-12	R.Bartolucci	Financial Domain First Priority for Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions
5	12-12-12	R.Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force Request for Decision Evidence: Status of Response?
6	22-12-12	R.Bartolucci	Candidates-C ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Financial Domain
7	23-12-12	Candidates-NC	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Financial Domain
8	23-12-12	Candidates-C	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain
9	23-12-12	Candidates-NC	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain
10	23-12-12	Candidates-C	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain
11	23-12-12	Candidates-NC	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain
12	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Proceeding with Requests for Evidence behind ONR/ONTC Decisions
13	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain
14	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain
15	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Economic Base

No.	Date	To	Subject Heading
16	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Economic Development
17	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Accessibility/Mobility of Area Residents
18	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Municipal Tax Base Domain
19	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Employment Domain
20	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Social Domain
21	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Environment Domain
22	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Energy Domain
23	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Public Safety Domain
24	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Industrial Development Domain
25	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Health /Medical Services Domain
26	26-12-12	R. Bartolucci	Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONTC Divestment Decision
27	27-12-12	Candidates-NC	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: ONTC Domain
28	27-12-12	Candidates-C	ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: ONTC Domain

### Email 1

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** October-29-12 9:51 PM

**To:** Rick Bartolucci

**Subject:** Update re the ONR-ONTC Project, and the VIA Town Meeting in S.S. Marie on November 8

Rick,

I have been asked to assist Transport Action Canada (TA C), Transport Action Ontario (TA O), and the Coalition for Algoma Passenger Transport (CAPT) on initiatives involving the Ontario Northland and VIA Rail.

The purpose of this note is to inform you of those activities, and in the case of the ONR-ONTC task I will be seeking your advice on whether and how to proceed with a mission that seems rife with both opportunities and pitfalls.



In regard to my ONR-ONTC and VIA philosophy, I have previously expressed my belief that ways should and could be found, and implemented, to ensure that rail becomes and remains a core part of passenger and freight transport throughout all the regions of Ontario, with emphasis on those regions such as Northeastern Ontario and Northwestern Ontario which are seriously underserved by the rail mode at present and for the foreseeable future.

In this latter regard I will be making a presentation in Sault Ste. Marie on November 8 at the National Dream Renewal (NDR) town meeting that is co-sponsored by Transport Action Canada and the Coalition for Algoma Passenger Transport. The VIA link of particular interest is the one that formerly ran between SS Marie and Sudbury. I will send you the announcement in the event that the matter may be of interest.

I hope that all is well with you and the family.

Best wishes,

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 2**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** November-23-12 4:59 PM  
**To:** 'wellarb@uottawa.ca'  
**Cc:** hwgow@sympatico.ca  
**Subject:** FW: ONTC

Rick Bartolucci, Minister

Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

As per a prior communication (October 29, 2012), I was asked by Transport Action Ontario to make inquiries about the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision. The present communication is a first step towards assembling the body of evidence which was used by the government to make that decision.

It is my expectation that all the requested materials are available in digital format, so there is no need to send paper documents, just the report or file titles and the links. In this way the referenced materials are readily available to members of the ONTC Research Task Force, as well as citizens, public interest groups, elected officials, business operators, the media, and so on.

For analytical purposes, there are two components to this initial information request, that is, a regional impact assessment component and an ONTC component. My interest in body of evidence materials is summarized as follows, and more details can be provided if

Regional Impact Assessment Studies



The region involved is the service area for rail freight and rail passenger service provided by ONTC, and I believe that two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

Since I do not know how Northern Development and Mines or the ONTC categorize or label regional impact assessment studies, I am using generic terms which should be sufficient to begin to identify the body of pertinent documentation. And, again, should questions arise, the terms can be sharpened as needed.

It is my expectation, therefore, that regional impact assessment study domains which are pertinent to the divestment deliberations include those listed below, and it is for these domains that I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and the links to those materials.

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

#### ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.

As noted above, this is the first round of the inquiry, and it is most likely that other topics will arise.

In addition, I am well aware of the likelihood that MNDM has studies on file for domains other than or different from those named, as well as studies commissioned for divestment deliberations, and I would appreciate having the titles of those materials and the links brought to my attention at the earliest moment.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining the requested documents at the earliest moment.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of documents the sooner we can present our findings as to the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision.

Kind personal regards.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 3**

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** November-27-12 8:26 PM

**To:** Rick Bartolucci

**Cc:** 'charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca'; 'carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca'; 'Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca'; 'jvanthof-qp@ndp.on.ca'; 'dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca'; 'mmantha-qp@ndp.on.ca'; 'claudie.gravelle@parl.gc.ca'; 'gbiisson@ndp.on.ca'; 'lavignem@ndp.on.ca'; 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'; 'glenn.thibeault@parl.gc.ca'

**Subject:** Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

As you are aware from the emails of October 29, 2012, and November 23, 2012, I was asked by Transport Action Ontario to make inquiries about the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision. In addition, however, as part of the assignment I was asked to examine the soundness of the ONR termination decision, a distinction which I did not make explicit in the earlier communication, and one which I should not have presumed to be generally understood.

This communication makes that distinction explicit, and I apologize for not being careful to refer to both the ONTC and the ONR in the previous communications.

For the most part, as comparison of the emails quickly reveals, there is high degree of correspondence between the two emails, the only changes of significance being the specific mention of the ONR in several places, and the reference to other provincial agencies and/or offices which may have been engaged in the decision processes. In the interests of avoiding confusion, this communication is to be regarded as the "communication of record".

The present communication is a first step towards assembling the body of evidence which was used by the government to make the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

It is my expectation that all the requested materials are available in digital format, so there is no need to send paper documents, just the report or file titles and the links. In this way the referenced materials are readily available to members of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force,

as well as citizens, public interest groups, elected officials, business operators, the media, and so on.

For analytical purposes, there are two components to this initial information request, that is, a regional impact assessment component and an ONR/ONTC component. My interest in body of evidence materials is summarized as follows, and more details can be provided if needed.

#### A. Regional Impact Assessment Studies

The region involved is the area for rail freight and rail passenger service provided by ONR/ONTC, and I believe that two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

Since I do not know how Northern Development and Mines, or other provincial agencies or offices, or the ONTC categorize or label regional impact assessment studies, I am using generic terms which should be sufficient to begin to identify the body of pertinent documentation. And, again, should questions arise the terms can be sharpened as needed.

It is my expectation, therefore, that regional impact assessment study domains which are pertinent to the divestment deliberations include those listed below, and it is for these domains that I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and the links to those materials.

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure construction and maintenance
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

#### B. ONR/ONTC

For the ONR/ONTC component my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONR/ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again, I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.

As noted above, this is the first round of the inquiry, and it is most likely that other topics will arise.

In addition, I appreciate the likelihood that MNDM and/or other provincial agencies or offices and/or ONTC has/have studies on file for domains other than or different from those named, as well as studies commissioned for divestment deliberations, and I would appreciate having the titles of those materials and the links brought to my attention at the earliest moment.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining access to the requested documents.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of documents the sooner we can present our findings as to the soundness of the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

Regards.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

#### **Email 4**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-07-12 11:05 AM

**To:** Rick Bartolucci

**Cc:** 'charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca'; 'carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca'; 'Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca'; 'jvanthof-q@ndp.on.ca'; 'dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca'; 'mmantha-q@ndp.on.ca'; 'claudio.gravelle@parl.gc.ca'; hwgow@sympatico.ca; 'gbiisson@ndp.on.ca'; 'lavignem@ndp.on.ca'; 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'; 'glenn.thibeault@parl.gc.ca'; Harry Valentine (hvalentine1@cogeco.ca); Linda Savory-Gordon <Linda.Savory-Gordon@algonau.ca> (Linda.Savory-Gordon@algonau.ca); Maggie Sigouin (maggie4@puc.net); Mayor Alan Spacek (alspacek@gmail.com); peter.politis@cochraneontario.com; Marie PRICE (coramari PRICE@gmail.com); creative.translations@rogers.com

**Subject:** Financial Domain First Priority for Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

RE: Financial Domain First Priority for Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions

As per the previous communications of November 23, 2012 and November 27, 2012, I identified a number of domains for which the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force requested copies of study reports and related productions used to support/justify the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

And, also as per the two communications, I provided terms of reference for the requested materials.

Based on a review of media reports, suggestions provided to me by various sources, and my experience with similar Task Force projects, the financial domain has been selected as the first priority of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force.

I therefore look forward to receiving the financial study reports and associated productions at the earliest moment.

In that regard, I would appreciate learning the schedule for providing the requested materials, with emphasis on the start date.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining full and timely access to the requested financial materials.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of financial domain documents the sooner we can assembling our findings as to the soundness of the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

---

From: Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

Sent: November-27-12 8:26 PM

To: Rick Bartolucci

Cc: 'charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca'; 'carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca'; 'Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca'; 'jvanthof-q@ndp.on.ca'; 'dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca'; 'mmantha-q@ndp.on.ca'; 'claudie.gravelle@parl.gc.ca'; 'gbisson@ndp.on.ca'; 'lavignem@ndp.on.ca'; 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'; 'glenn.thibeault@parl.gc.ca'

Subject: Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONR Termination and ONTC Divestment Decisions

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

As you are aware from the emails of October 29, 2012, and November 23, 2012, I was asked by Transport Action Ontario to make inquiries about the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision. In addition, however, as part of the assignment I was asked to examine the soundness of the ONR termination decision, a distinction which I did not make explicit in the earlier communication, and one which I should not have presumed to be generally understood.

This communication makes that distinction explicit, and I apologize for not being careful to refer to both the ONTC and the ONR in the previous communications.

For the most part, as comparison of the emails quickly reveals, there is high degree of correspondence between the two emails, the only changes of significance being the specific mention of the ONR in several places, and the reference to other provincial agencies and/or offices which may have been engaged in the decision processes. In the interests of avoiding confusion, this communication is to be regarded as the “communication of record”.

The present communication is a first step towards assembling the body of evidence which was used by the government to make the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

It is my expectation that all the requested materials are available in digital format, so there is no need to send paper documents, just the report or file titles and the links. In this way the referenced materials are readily available to members of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force, as well as citizens, public interest groups, elected officials, business operators, the media, and so on.

For analytical purposes, there are two components to this initial information request, that is, a regional impact assessment component and an ONR/ONTC component. My interest in body of evidence materials is summarized as follows, and more details can be provided if needed.

#### A. Regional Impact Assessment Studies

The region involved is the area for rail freight and rail passenger service provided by ONR/ONTC, and I believe that two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

Since I do not know how Northern Development and Mines, or other provincial agencies or offices, or the ONTC categorize or label regional impact assessment studies, I am using generic terms which should be sufficient to begin to identify the body of pertinent documentation. And, again, should questions arise the terms can be sharpened as needed.

It is my expectation, therefore, that regional impact assessment study domains which are pertinent to the divestment deliberations include those listed below, and it is for these domains that I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and the links to those materials.

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure construction and maintenance
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

## B. ONR/ONTC

For the ONR/ONTC component my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONR/ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again, I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.

As noted above, this is the first round of the inquiry, and it is most likely that other topics will arise.

In addition, I appreciate the likelihood that MNDM and/or other provincial agencies or offices and/or ONTC has/have studies on file for domains other than or different from those named, as well as studies commissioned for divestment deliberations, and I would appreciate having the titles of those materials and the links brought to my attention at the earliest moment.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining access to the requested documents.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of documents the sooner we can present our findings as to the soundness of the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

Regards.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### Email 5

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-12-12 8:39 PM

**To:** Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; 'jvanthof-qp@ndp.on.ca'; 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'; 'gbisson@ndp.on.ca'; 'mmantha-qp@ndp.on.ca'; Mayor Alan Spacek (alspacek@gmail.com); 'peter.politis@cochraneontario.com'; 'bchiarelli.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'fonom.info@gmail.com'; 'fgelinas-qp@ndp.on.ca'; 'hwgow@sympatico.ca'; Harry Valentine (hvalentine1@cogeco.ca); 'dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'lavignem@ndp.on.ca'; 'Paul-André Larose'

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force Request for Decision Evidence: Status of Response?



Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

This is a follow-up to the emails to you of October 29, November 23, and November 27, 2012 regarding the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions taken by the Liberal government earlier this year. As of the present date none of the communications has been acknowledged, much less received a response.

A number of reasons have been suggested to account for your failure to acknowledge, much less respond to the requests for information on the financial aspect of the ONR termination and ONTC divestment decisions.

However, it occurs that the failure to acknowledge and/or respond may be due to the fact that the email address which I used (from earlier communications on other matters) websites is not accurate, and you are not aware of the requests. I hasten to add that I did not receive a 'failure to deliver' message in association with any of the emails sent to the address used for the previous ONR/ONTC communications, so the matter of non-response is a puzzlement to say the least.

I have therefore added an address and copied this communication to various individuals, and I am requesting that anyone with an email address that differs from those above be so kind as to forward this communication to you on my behalf. And, of course, I look forward to receiving confirmation of the accurate email address at the earliest moment.

Finally, I note for your information that the second priority of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force has been identified, and I will communicate that information to you as soon as your email address is confirmed

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 6**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-22-12 3:07 PM  
**To:** 'wellarb@uottawa.ca'  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Financial Domain

Kathleen Wynne,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Ms. Wynne,

I believe that you were a member of Cabinet when the decisions were made to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and I

understand that you participated in those decisions. If either statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the financial domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., -- which were provided to you for your consideration

Please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the financial productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source for digital versions which can be readily distributed to Task Force members and interested parties.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of financial arguments were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the financial arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many more aspects of the financial domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a financial perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force

### Email 7

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-23-12 9:05 AM  
**To:** 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'  
**Cc:** jvanthof-qp@ndp.on.ca; gbisson@ndp.on.ca; vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org; mmantha-qp@ndp.on.ca; fgelinas-qp@ndp.on.ca; lavignem@ndp.on.ca; dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Mayor Alan Spacek (alspacek@gmail.com); mayor.amaroso@cityssm.on.ca; Maggie Sigouin (maggie4@puc.net); 'Marie PRICE (coramarieprice@gmail.com)'; 'Linda Savory-Gordon <Linda.Savory-Gordon@algonau.ca> (Linda.Savory-Gordon@algonau.ca)';

'dmiasek@rogers.com'; 'creative.translations@rogers.com'; hwgow@sympatico.ca

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Financial Domain

Gerard Kennedy,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Mr. Kennedy,

You were not a member of Cabinet in 2012 when the Ontario government (Liberal) terminated *The Northlander* and divested the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and as a result it seems likely that you did not have access to the productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – which were presumably considered by Cabinet in arriving at the respective decisions.

Nevertheless, since each decision has had and will continue to have major impacts on the residents, businesses, municipalities, institutions, organizations, and so on in the region of Northeastern Ontario and beyond, it seems to me that a candidate for the leadership of the Ontario Liberal Party would want to ensure that he or she has full and complete knowledge as to the financials of the termination and divestment decisions.

I would therefore appreciate learning what you have done or plan to do to become apprised of the financial aspects of the decisions, and upon receipt of that information I will have questions to ask of you regarding the financial domain of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force initiative.

I look forward to receiving your reply at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force

### **Email 8**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-23-12 7:29 PM

**To:** 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'

**Cc:** A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin ; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain

Harinder Takhar,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Mr. Takhar,

I believe that you were a member of Cabinet when the decisions were made to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and I

understand that you participated in those decisions. If either statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the transportation domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative transportation strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were provided to you for your consideration

Please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the transportation productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions which can be readily distributed to Task Force members and interested parties.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving transportation issues and concerns related to infrastructure, services, alternatives, reliability, resiliency, capacity, sustainability, etc., were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the transportation arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many more aspects of the transportation domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a transportation perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force

### **Email 9**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-23-12 7:37 PM

**To:** sandra@signup4sandra.ca

**Cc:** A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M.

Sigouin ; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain

Ms. Sandra Pupatello,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Ms. Pupatello,

You were not a member of Cabinet in 2012 when the Ontario government (Liberal) terminated *The Northlander* and divested the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and as a result it seems likely that you did not have access to the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative transportation strategies, value for money analyses, etc., -- which were presumably considered by Cabinet in arriving at the respective decisions.

Nevertheless, since each decision has had and will continue to have major impacts on the residents, businesses, municipalities, institutions, organizations, and so on in the region of Northeastern Ontario and beyond, it seems to me that a candidate for the leadership of the Ontario Liberal Party would want to ensure that he or she has full and complete knowledge as to the transportation aspects of the termination and divestment decisions.

I would therefore appreciate learning what you have done or plan to do to become apprised of the transportation aspects of the decisions, and upon receipt of that information I will have questions to ask of you regarding the transportation domain of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force initiative.

I look forward to receiving your reply at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

**Email 10**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-23-12 7:54 PM  
**To:** csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain

Charles Sousa,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Mr. Sousa,

I believe that you were a member of Cabinet when the decisions were made to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and I

understand that you participated in those decisions. If either statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the northern development domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative development strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were provided to you for your consideration

Please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the northern development productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions which can be readily distributed to Task Force members and interested parties.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving northern development issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the northern development arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative development strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many more aspects of the northern development domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a northern development perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 11**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-23-12 7:46 PM

**To:** gk@gerardkennedy.ca

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain

Gerard Kennedy,  
Ontario Liberal Party Leadership Candidate

Dear Mr. Kennedy,

You were not a member of Cabinet in 2012 when the Ontario government (Liberal) terminated *The Northlander* and divested the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), and as a result it seems likely that you did not have access to the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative transportation strategies, value for money analyses, etc., -- which were presumably considered by Cabinet in arriving at the respective decisions.

Nevertheless, since each decision has had and will continue to have major impacts on the residents, businesses, municipalities, institutions, organizations, and so on in the region of Northeastern Ontario and beyond, it seems to me that a candidate for the leadership of the Ontario Liberal Party would want to ensure that he or she has full and complete knowledge as to northern development aspects of the termination and divestment decisions.

I would therefore appreciate learning what you have done or plan to do to become apprised of the transportation aspects of the decisions, and upon receipt of that information I will have questions to ask of you regarding the northern development domain of the ONR/ONTC Research Task Force initiative.

I look forward to receiving your reply at the earliest moment.

Sincerely,

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 12**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 2:42 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca'

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziatti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : Proceeding with Requests for Evidence Behind ONR/ONTC Decisions



Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

In the absence of a response to prior communications concerning Financial Domain studies done to justify terminating *The Northlander* and divesting the Ontario Northland Railway Commission, and no indication that a response is forthcoming, I am obliged to proceed without the guidance that the Financial Domain productions would have provided when prioritizing the other elements comprising the body of evidence to be reviewed under the heading, Regional Impact Assessment Studies.

You were previously informed about my interest in this regard in the email of November 23, 2012. It follows below for ease of reference.

I note for the record that the failure on your part to respond to my inquiry in a timely manner has compromised my ability to specify the order of priority for the requested digital productions, or the manual productions should there be materials which for some reason are still prepared, processed, etc., in the non-digital mode by DNDM.

Finally, and for reasons which you will readily appreciate, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario are copied in this and subsequent communications to you about the body of evidence behind the termination and divestment decisions.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]  
**Sent:** November-23-12 7:45 PM  
**To:** Rick Bartolucci  
**Cc:** [charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca](mailto:charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca); [carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca](mailto:carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca); [Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca](mailto:Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca); [jvanthof-gp@ndp.on.ca](mailto:jvanthof-gp@ndp.on.ca); [dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org); [Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca](mailto:Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca); [mmantha-gp@ndp.on.ca](mailto:mmantha-gp@ndp.on.ca); [claudgravelle@parl.gc.ca](mailto:claudgravelle@parl.gc.ca); [gbisson@ndp.on.ca](mailto:gbisson@ndp.on.ca); [lavignem@ndp.on.ca](mailto:lavignem@ndp.on.ca); 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'  
**Subject:** Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONTC Divestment Decision

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

As per a prior communication (October 29, 2012), I was asked by Transport Action Ontario to make inquiries about the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision. The present communication is a first step towards assembling the body of evidence which was used by the government to make that decision.

It is my expectation that all the requested materials are available in digital format, so there is no need to send paper documents, just the report or file titles and the links. In this way the referenced materials are readily available to members of the ONTC Research Task Force, as well as citizens, public interest groups, elected officials, business operators, the media, and so on.

For analytical purposes, there are two components to this initial information request, that is, a regional impact assessment component and an ONTC component. My interest in body of evidence materials is summarized as follows, and more details can be provided if needed.

#### A. Regional Impact Assessment Studies

The region involved is the area for rail freight and rail passenger service provided by ONTC, and I believe that two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

Since I do not know how Northern Development and Mines or the ONTC categorize or label regional impact assessment studies, I am using generic terms which should be sufficient to begin to identify the body of pertinent documentation. And, again, should questions arise the terms can be sharpened as needed.

It is my expectation, therefore, that regional impact assessment study domains which are pertinent to the divestment deliberations include those listed below, and it is for these domains that I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and the links to those materials.

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure construction and maintenance
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

#### B. ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-

2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.

As noted above, this is the first round of the inquiry, and it is most likely that other topics will arise.

In addition, I appreciate the likelihood that MNDM has studies on file for domains other than or different from those named, as well as studies commissioned for divestment deliberations, and I would appreciate having the titles of those materials and the links brought to my attention at the earliest moment.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining access to the requested documents.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of documents the sooner we can present our findings as to the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision.

Regards.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 13**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 3:26 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca'

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca';

'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca';

'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D.

Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J.

Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T.

Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Transportation Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the transportation domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative transportation strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the transportation productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's transportation productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the transportation domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving transportation issues and concerns related to infrastructure, services, alternatives, reliability, resiliency, capacity, sustainability, etc., were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the transportation arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the transportation domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a transportation perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

## **Email 14**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 3:44 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Northern Development Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

*You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.*

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the northern development\_domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative northern development strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the northern development productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's northern development productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the northern development domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving northern development issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the northern development arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the northern development domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a northern development perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 15**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 4:15 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratas; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Economic Base

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the economic base domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative economic base strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the economic base productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's economic base productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the economic base domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving economic base issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the economic base arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the economic base domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a northern development perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards.at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 16**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 4:19 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org';



Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratas; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Economic Development

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the economic development domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative economic development strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the economic development productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's economic base productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the economic development domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving economic development issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the economic development arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the economic development domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a northern development perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 17**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 4:29 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Accessibility/Mobility of Area Residents

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to *terminate The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the accessibility/mobility of area residents domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative accessibility/mobility strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you

and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the accessibility/mobility productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's accessibility/mobility of area residents productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the accessibility/mobility of area residents domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving accessibility/mobility of area residents were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the accessibility/mobility of area residents arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of accessibility/mobility of area residents domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an accessibility/mobility of area residents perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 18**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 4:35 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca';

'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrutin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Municipal Tax Base Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the municipal tax base domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative municipal tax base strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the municipal tax base productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's municipal tax base productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the municipal tax base domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving municipal tax base issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the municipal tax base arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions

– study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the municipal tax base domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from a municipal tax base perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 19**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 7:47 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratas; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Employment Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the employment domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative employment strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the employment productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's employment productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the employment domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving employment issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the employment arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the employment domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 20**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 7:53 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T.



Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: :Social Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister

Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the social domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the social domain productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's social productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the social domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving social issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the social domain arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the social domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.



I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards.at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### Email 21

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 7:58 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Environment Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the environment domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative environment domain strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the environment domain productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM

provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's environment domain productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the environment domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving environmental issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the environmental arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the environment domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an environmental perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 22**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 8:02 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Energy Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the energy domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative energy strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the energy productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's energy productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the energy domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving energy issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the energy arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the energy domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 23**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 8:07 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Public Safety Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the public safety domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, public safety strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the public safety productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's public safety productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the public safety productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving public safety issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the public safety arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the public safety domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

#### **Email 24**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 8:12 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrutin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Industrial Development Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the industrial development domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative industrial development strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the industrial development productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's industrial development productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the industrial development domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s), source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.

Second, a number of arguments involving industrial development issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the industrial development arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of the industrial development domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

## **Email 25**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-26-12 8:16 PM

**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force: Health /Medical Services Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions. In this communication the focus is on the health/medical services domain.

First, there is the matter of the productions – study reports, survey reports, commissioned statements, expert opinions, comparative analyses, literature reviews, impact assessment reports, alternative health/medical services strategies, value for money analyses, etc., – which were produced by MNDM under your authority, and/or those which were provided to you and other members of Cabinet by some other Ontario government agency, or non-government entity.

In my experience all MNDM productions would have been undertaken at taxpayer expense for the benefit of all the citizens of Ontario, and I therefore request being informed at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the health/medical services productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details) which MNDM provided to members of Cabinet. Upon receipt of the list of MNDM's health/medical services productions, I will specify which productions the Task Force wishes to receive from MNDM.

As for the health/medical services domain productions provided to you by another agency of the Government of Ontario, or any other entity, please inform me at the earliest moment as to the particulars of the productions (viz., title, author(s). source, date of production, and any other pertinent identification details), so that I may contact the source/sponsoring agency for digital versions.

Of course, it would be even better from a timing and convenience standpoint if you send me the digital versions directly, and I invite you to do so.



Second, a number of arguments involving health/medical services issues and concerns were no doubt made with regard to terminating or not terminating *The Northlander* and divesting or not divesting the ONTC.

Please inform me as to the health/medical services arguments upon which you based your decision to support or oppose the termination and divestment decisions, and the specific productions – study reports, survey reports, financial statements, value for money analyses, etc., – used to arrive at your decisions.

I note in closing that there are many aspects of health/medical services domain to be pursued, and I am optimistic that your response in the above regards will enable us to cut to the chase in ascertaining the soundness of the termination and divestment decisions from an employment perspective.

I look forward to receiving your reply in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

### **Email 26**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]  
**Sent:** December-26-12 8:45 PM  
**To:** rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org; Rick Bartolucci; 'rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca  
**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrutin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox  
**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : ONTC Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions.

In this communication I re-visit the matter of the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), a matter which was raised with you in the email of November 23, 2012, and to which you have not responded.

The part of the email pertaining to the ONTC is copied and repeated, as follows:

“ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.”

By copy, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario, are informed of the previous and current communications to you regarding the ONTC Domain. The Task Force has questions to ask of them regarding the statement in bold above, as well as your response or non-response to this communication.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** December-26-12 2:42 PM

**To:** [rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org); Rick Bartolucci; 'Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca'

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziatti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : Proceeding with Requests for Evidence Behind ONR/ONTC Decisions

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

In the absence of a response to prior communications concerning Financial Domain studies done to justify terminating *The Northlander* and divesting the Ontario Northland Railway Commission, and no indication that a response is forthcoming, I am obliged to proceed without the guidance that the Financial Domain productions would have provided when prioritizing the other elements comprising the body of evidence to be reviewed under the heading, Regional Impact Assessment Studies.

You were previously informed about my interest in this regard in the email of November 23, 2012. It follows below for ease of reference.

I note for the record that the failure on your part to respond to my inquiry in a timely manner has compromised my ability to specify the order of priority for the requested digital productions, or the manual productions should there be materials which for some reason are still prepared, processed, etc., in the non-digital mode by DNDM.

Finally, and for reasons which you will readily appreciate, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario are copied in this and subsequent communications to you about the body of evidence behind the termination and divestment decisions.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** November-23-12 7:45 PM

**To:** Rick Bartolucci

**Cc:** [charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca](mailto:charlie.angus@parl.gc.ca); [carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca](mailto:carol.hughes@parl.gc.ca); [Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca](mailto:Jay.Aspin@parl.gc.ca); [jvanthof-gp@ndp.on.ca](mailto:jvanthof-gp@ndp.on.ca); [dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:dorazietti.mpp@liberal.ola.org); [Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca](mailto:Bryan.Hayes@parl.gc.ca); [mmantha-gp@ndp.on.ca](mailto:mmantha-gp@ndp.on.ca); [claudie.gravelle@parl.gc.ca](mailto:claudie.gravelle@parl.gc.ca); [gbiisson@ndp.on.ca](mailto:gbiisson@ndp.on.ca); [lavignem@ndp.on.ca](mailto:lavignem@ndp.on.ca); 'vic.fedeli@pc.ola.org'

**Subject:** Information Request Re Studies Done to Support/Justify ONTC Divestment Decision

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

As per a prior communication (October 29, 2012), I was asked by Transport Action Ontario to make inquiries about the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision. The present communication is a first step towards assembling the body of evidence which was used by the government to make that decision.

It is my expectation that all the requested materials are available in digital format, so there is no need to send paper documents, just the report or file titles and the links. In this way the referenced materials are readily available to members of the ONTC Research Task Force, as well as citizens, public interest groups, elected officials, business operators, the media, and so on.

For analytical purposes, there are two components to this initial information request, that is, a regional impact assessment component and an ONTC component. My interest in body of evidence materials is summarized as follows, and more details can be provided if needed.

#### A. Regional Impact Assessment Studies

The region involved is the area for rail freight and rail passenger service provided by ONTC, and I believe that two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

Since I do not know how Northern Development and Mines or the ONTC categorize or label regional impact assessment studies, I am using generic terms which should be sufficient to begin to identify the body of pertinent documentation. And, again, should questions arise the terms can be sharpened as needed.

It is my expectation, therefore, that regional impact assessment study domains which are pertinent to the divestment deliberations include those listed below, and it is for these domains that I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and the links to those materials.

1. Economic
2. Economic development
3. Transportation infrastructure construction and maintenance
4. Municipal tax base
5. Financial
6. Social
7. Employment
8. Environment
9. Energy
10. Public safety
11. Industrial development
12. Accessibility/mobility of area residents
13. Health/medical infrastructure/services

#### B. ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.

As noted above, this is the first round of the inquiry, and it is most likely that other topics will arise.

In addition, I appreciate the likelihood that MNDM has studies on file for domains other than or different from those named, as well as studies commissioned for divestment deliberations, and I would appreciate having the titles of those materials and the links brought to my attention at the earliest moment.

Rick, thank you in advance for your assistance in obtaining access to the requested documents.

As you are aware time is of the essence in this matter, and the sooner we can begin the review of documents the sooner we can present our findings as to the soundness of the ONTC divestment decision.

Regards.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada

### Email 27

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-27-12 8:17 PM

**To:** sandra@signup4sandra.ca

**Cc:** A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** FW: ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : ONTC Domain

Dear Ms. Pupatello,

As stated in the email of December 29, 2012 to Rick Bartolucci, copied to you and other candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario, the Transport Action Ontario Task Force is investigating the soundness of the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission. The general nature of the investigation is contained in the email of November 23, 2012, which follows below.

At this time I have several comments and questions for your consideration with regard to the ONTC component of the email of November 23, 2012.

1. The request for information about studies, etc., was made November 23, 2012, but to this point in time the communication has not been acknowledged much less shown the courtesy of a pertinent response. In your opinion, is this acceptable conduct on the part of the Minister and officials of the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)?
2. In the event that you do not consider this conduct to be acceptable, what will you do in the immediate term to oblige the Minister, Rick Bartolucci, and MNDM officials, to provide the requested productions so that the Task Force can undertake its research mission?

3. It is my understanding upon review of communications by residents, businesses, etc., affected by the termination and divestment decisions that their requests for information are being met by “stonewalling” on the part of the Liberal government. What will you do in the immediate term to oblige the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines to “open the files” so that ordinary citizens as well as Task Force members can examine the record of decisions and ascertain for themselves the soundness of the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission. I hasten to add in this regard by way of a “heads up” that I am explicitly requesting that you not go the FOI route. Rather, you are being asked to inform us as to what you will do to oblige the Ministry to “open the files” so that taxpayers can see for themselves what studies have been done in association with the termination and divestment decisions.
4. I note for your consideration, and as per my repeated requests for digital productions, that Canada has been in the digital era since the 1970s, which makes the request for digital productions a very normal request. Moreover, given the distance factor, and the cost factor, it is standard procedure in such situations to opt for e-communications at every opportunity. What will you do in the immediate term to ensure that the productions requested in Task Force communications as well as in communications by residents, businesses, institutions, etc., are in digital format?
5. As you may be aware, undertaking this kind of public interest research is supported by intervenor funding in several jurisdictions, including Ontario. What will you do in the immediate term to obtain funding from MNDM and/or other government agencies to support the Transport Action Ontario Research Task Force which was commissioned in part to address the failure of the Government of Ontario to properly inform residents, businesses, etc., as to the reasons and associated evidence behind the termination and divestment decisions?

Ms. Pupatello, there are other questions to be asked about the ONTC section of the email of November 23, 2012 to Rick Bartolucci, but these will suffice for starters.

On behalf of the Task Force, I look forward to receiving your response in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** December-26-12 8:45 PM

**To:** [rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org); Rick Bartolucci; [rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org); [Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca](mailto:Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca)

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T.

Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : ONTC Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister

Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions.

In this communication I re-visit the matter of the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), a matter which was raised with you in the email of November 23, 2012, and to which you have not responded.

The part of the email pertaining to the ONTC is copied and repeated, as follows:

“ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.”

By copy, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario, are informed of the previous and current communications to you regarding the ONTC Domain. The Task Force has questions to ask of them regarding the statement [in quotes] above, as well as your response or non-response to this communication.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP

Distinguished Research Fellow

Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force

Transport Action Canada

### **Email 28**

**From:** Barry Wellar [mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca]

**Sent:** December-27-12 8:20 PM



**To:** csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org

**Cc:** A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziotti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turrutin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** FW: ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : ONTC Domain

Dear Mr. Sousa,

As stated in the email of December 29, 2012 to Rick Bartolucci, copied to you and other candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario, the Transport Action Ontario Task Force is investigating the soundness of the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission. The general nature of the investigation is contained in the email of November 23, 2012, which follows below.

At this time I have several comments and questions for your consideration with regard to the ONTC component of the email of November 23, 2012.

1. The request for information about studies, etc., was made November 23, 2102, but to this point in time the communication has not been acknowledged much less shown the courtesy of a pertinent response. In your opinion, is this acceptable conduct on the part of the Minister and officials of the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNMD)?
2. In the event that you do not consider this conduct to be acceptable, what will you do in the immediate term to oblige the Minister, Rick Bartolucci, and MNMD officials, to provide the requested productions so that the Task Force can undertake its research mission?
3. It is my understanding upon review of communications by residents, businesses, etc., affected by the termination and divestment decisions that their requests for information are being met by “stonewalling” on the part of the Liberal government. What will you do in the immediate term to oblige the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines to “open the files” so that ordinary citizens as well as Task Force members can examine the record of decisions and ascertain for themselves the soundness of the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission. I hasten to add in this regard by way of a “heads up” that I am explicitly requesting that you not go the FOI route. Rather, you are being asked to inform us as to what you will do to oblige the Ministry to “open the files” so that taxpayers can see for themselves what studies have been done in association with the termination and divestment decisions.
4. I note for your consideration, and as per my repeated requests for digital productions, that Canada has been in the digital era since the 1970s, which makes the request for digital productions a very normal request. Moreover, given the distance factor, and the cost factor, it is standard procedure in such situations to opt for e-communications at every opportunity. What will you do in the immediate term to ensure that the productions requested in Task Force communications as well as in communications by residents, businesses, institutions, etc., are in digital format?
5. As you may be aware, undertaking this kind of public interest research is supported by intervenor funding in several jurisdictions, including Ontario. What will you do in the immediate term to obtain funding from MNMD and/or other government agencies to

support the Transport Action Ontario Research Task Force which was commissioned in part to address the failure of the Government of Ontario to properly inform residents, businesses, etc., as to the reasons and associated evidence behind the termination and divestment decisions?

Ms. Sousa, there are other questions to be asked about the ONTC section of the email of November 23, 2012 to Rick Bartolucci, but these will suffice for starters.

On behalf of the Task Force, I look forward to receiving your response in the above regards at the earliest moment.

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** December-26-12 8:45 PM

**To:** [rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org); Rick Bartolucci; [rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org); [Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca](mailto:Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca)

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziatti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : ONTC Domain

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

You were Minister of MNDM and a member of Cabinet when it made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, and I believe you participated in both those decisions. If that statement is incorrect, please so advise me at your earliest convenience.

If you did participate in the decisions, I would appreciate learning the specifics behind your support for or opposition to the termination and divestment decisions.

In this communication I re-visit the matter of the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC), a matter which was raised with you in the email of November 23, 2012, and to which you have not responded.

The part of the email pertaining to the ONTC is copied and repeated, as follows:.

“ONTC

For the ONTC my focus at this time is on rail freight and rail passenger infrastructure and services, and the same two timelines are appropriate in this circumstance, that is, a 50-year historical timeline (1962-2012), and a 25-year projective timeline (2013-2038).

The ONTC domain of interest at his time involves studies and/or reports, internal and external, as to what was done, what could be done, and what should be done to maintain and/or increase rail freight activity and rail passenger activity for the historical period (1962-2012) and the projective period (2013-2038). Again I wish to be informed about the associated report or file titles and links.”

By copy, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario, are informed of the previous and current communications to you regarding the ONTC Domain. The Task Force has questions to ask of them regarding the statement [in quotes] above, as well as your response or non-response to this communication.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR/ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada

---

**From:** Barry Wellar [<mailto:wellarb@uottawa.ca>]

**Sent:** December-26-12 2:42 PM

**To:** [rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org](mailto:rbartolucci.mpp@liberal.ola.org); Rick Bartolucci; [Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca](mailto:Laura.Blondeau@ontario.ca)'

**Cc:** 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; 'sandra@signup4sandra.ca'; 'contact@kathleenwynne.ca'; 'csousa.mpp.co@liberal.ola.org'; 'ehoskins.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'contact@renewliberal.ca'; 'htakhar.mpp@liberal.ola.org'; 'gk@gerardkennedy.ca'; A. Spacek ; L. Savory-Gordon ; D. Amoroso; D. Oraziatti ; F.Gelinas ; FONOM; G. Bisson ; G. Courville ; G. Mayer ; H. Gow; J. Fratasi; J. Vanthof ; M. Lavigne ; M. Mantha ; M. Price ; M. Sigouin; P. Miasek ; P. Politis ; T. Turritin; V. Fedeli; W. Mitchell; W. Wilcox

**Subject:** ONR/ONTC Research Task Force : Proceeding with Requests for Evidence Behind ONR/ONTC Decisions

Rick Bartolucci, Minister  
Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM)

Rick,

In the absence of a response to prior communications concerning Financial Domain studies done to justify terminating *The Northlander* and divesting the Ontario Northland Railway Commission, and no indication that a response is forthcoming, I am obliged to proceed without the guidance that the Financial Domain productions would have provided when prioritizing the other elements comprising the body of evidence to be reviewed under the heading, Regional Impact Assessment Studies.

You were previously informed about my interest in this regard in the email of November 23, 2012. It follows below for ease of reference.

I note for the record that the failure on your part to respond to my inquiry in a timely manner has compromised my ability to specify the order of priority for the requested digital productions, or the manual productions should there be materials which for some reason are still prepared, processed, etc., in the non-digital mode by DNDM.

Finally, and for reasons which you will readily appreciate, the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario are copied in this and subsequent communications to you about the body of evidence behind the termination and divestment decisions.

Barry

Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP  
Distinguished Research Fellow  
Transport Action Canada