

**Inventory of the Provided Studies and Other Productions  
Containing Evidence, Advisories, Recommendations,  
Opinions, Analyses, etc., Underlying the Decisions Made  
by Cabinet to Terminate *The Northlander* and to  
Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission**

**Dr. Barry Wellar, MCIP**

Distinguished Research Fellow  
Chair, ONR-ONTC Research Task Force  
Transport Action Canada  
Principal, Wellar Consulting Inc.



***Report prepared for  
Transport Action Ontario  
and  
Transport Action Canada***

January 2013

## 1. Background

The decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission (ONTC) are a matter of concern to a number of individuals, enterprises, and institutions, including Transport Action Canada and Transport Action Ontario. The ONR-ONTC Research Task Force was created by Transport Action Canada and Transport Action Ontario to examine the research behind the decisions by Cabinet.

The mission of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force is to examine the studies done by the Government of Ontario through the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM), as well as any other agencies or agents of the Government of Ontario, and to present:

1. An inventory of the provided studies and other productions containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.
2. An opinion as to the soundness of the research undertaken; and
3. An opinion as to the extent to which the decisions by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission are based upon, supported by, justified by, or are otherwise derived from methodologically sound research.

In order to compile materials for the first phase of the terms of reference, communications were sent to Rick Bartolucci, Minister, Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM), and to the candidates for the position of Leader, Liberal Party of Ontario because the Liberal party formed the government when the decisions were made to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

The objective of the communications was, as expressed in the first term of reference, to obtain

“... studies and other productions containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission”.

The details about Research Task Force communications sent to R. Bartolucci, E. Hoskins, G. Kennedy, G. Murray, S. Pupatello, C. Sousa, H. Takhar, and K. Wynne are

contained in the following reports which are posted on the Transport Action Canada, Transport Action Ontario, and Wellar Consulting Inc. websites:

1. [ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 1: Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.](#)
2. [Response by Rick Bartolucci, Minister, Northern Development and Mines to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate The Northlander and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2A.](#)
3. [Response by Eric Hoskins, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2B.](#)
4. [Response by Kathleen Wynne, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2C.](#)
6. [Response by Sandra Pupatello, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2D.](#)
7. [Response by Gerard Kennedy, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2E.](#)
8. [Response by Charles Sousa, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate The Northlander and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2F.](#)
9. [Response by Harinder Takhar, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate \*The Northlander\* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2G.](#)

**10. Response by Glen Murray, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2H.**

**2. Results of Asking Rick Bartolucci, Minister, Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM), and Liberal Party Leadership Candidates -- Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray, Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Takhar, and Kathleen Wynne -- for Studies and Other Productions Containing Evidence, Advisories, Recommendations, Opinions, Analyses, etc., Underlying the Decisions Made by Cabinet to Terminate *The Northlander* and to Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission**

The concluding sections of Interim Reports 2A to 2H contain the results of contacting Rick. Bartolucci, Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray, Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Takhar, and Kathleen Wynne. In the interests of accuracy, the concluding sections are repeated verbatim.

**A. Response by Rick Bartolucci, Minister, Northern Development and Mines to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2A. From section 3**

At the date of this writing, January 07, 2013, no reply has been received from Rick Bartolucci to any of the 20 emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR/ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies and other productions behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Consequently, Mr. Bartolucci has not provided the Research Task Force any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Bartolucci, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

**B. Response by Eric Hoskins, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2B. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Eric Hoskins to any of the emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Mr. Hoskins has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Hoskins, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

**C. Response by Kathleen Wynne, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2C. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Kathleen Wynne to any of the emails informing her of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Ms. Wynne has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Ms. Wynne, her contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Ms. Wynne was a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

**D. Response by Sandra Pupatello, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2D. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Sandra Pupatello to any of the emails informing her of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Ms. Pupatello has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Ms. Pupatello, her contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Ms. Pupatello was not a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

**E. Response by Gerard Kennedy, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2E. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Gerard Kennedy to any of the emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind

the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Mr. Kennedy has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Kennedy, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Mr. Kennedy was not a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

From section 5 of Interim Report E.

An email dated January 07, 2013 from Mr. Kennedy acknowledged receipt of the emails, and stated that the emails had been referred to his policy team for a response.

**F. Response by Charles Sousa, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate The Northlander and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2F. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Charles Sousa to any of the emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Mr. Sousa has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Sousa, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Mr. Sousa was a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

**G. Response by Harinder Takhar, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2G. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Harinder Takhar to any of the emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Mr. Takhar has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Takhar, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Mr. Takhar was a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

**H. Response by Glen Murray, Leadership Candidate, Liberal Party of Ontario, to Requests for Details About and Access to Studies Behind the Decisions to Terminate *The Northlander* and Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission: ONR-ONTC Research Task Force Interim Report 2H. From section 4.**

At the date of this writing, January 10, 2013, no reply has been received from Glen Murray to any of the emails informing him of the Transport Action Ontario ONR-ONTC Research Task Force, and/or requesting details about and access to studies behind the



decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

Or, to re-phrase in the interest of explicitness, Mr. Murray has not responded to any communication regarding the termination and divestment decisions and, as a result, has not provided the Research Task Force any details or comments whatsoever about any study or other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

In the event that pertinent information/productions are received from Mr. Murray, his contribution to the work of the ONR-ONTC Research Task Force will be updated as time and resources permit.

It is noted in closing that Mr. Murray was a member of Cabinet when Cabinet made the decisions to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

### **3. Summary Comment on the Results of Asking Rick Bartolucci, Minister, Ministry of Northern Development and Mines (MNDM), and Liberal Party Leadership Candidates – Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray, Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Takhar, and Kathleen Wynne – for Studies and Other Productions Containing Evidence, Advisories, Recommendations, Opinions, Analyses, etc., Underlying the Decisions Made by Cabinet to Terminate *The Northlander* and to Divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission**

Twenty (20) emails were sent to Rick Bartolucci, Minister of Northern Development and Mines, and four (4) original and fourteen (14) copied emails to each of the candidates for the position of leader, Liberal Party of Ontario (Eric Hoskins, Gerard Kennedy, Glen Murray Sandra Pupatello, Charles Sousa, Harinder Tackar, and Kathleen Wynne).

The net result of that extended and detailed quest for public studies and other productions is that it did not yield any information about, much less achieve access to any study or any other production containing evidence, advisories, recommendations, opinions, analyses, etc., underlying the decisions made by Cabinet to terminate *The Northlander* and to divest the Ontario Northland Transportation Commission.

#### **4. Referral of the ONR-ONTC File to the Information and Privacy Commissioner, Province of Ontario**

It may be that Transport Action Canada, Transport Action Ontario, other entities, and/or individuals may wish to refer this failure-to-provide-information matter to the attention of the Information and Privacy Commissioner, Province of Ontario.

In an additional report which expands the Task Force's scope of work, I identify several issues, problems, concerns, etc., that could be considered for inclusion in applications to Dr. Ann Cavoukian, Information and Privacy Commissioner, Province of Ontario.